

Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

RECENT WORKS ON THE HISTORY OF RELIGIONS¹

The expectations aroused in the readers of the first volume of Professor Moore's *History of Religions*, with regard to his wide knowledge combined with a penetrating and sympathetic imagination, his keen judgment and breadth of view, his skill in setting religious phenomena in the historical milieu, and abstracting large characterizations from concrete details,² will not be disappointed. The hand of the master has not lost its cunning. Thus in stating the appropriateness of treating the three religions of this volume together, he says in the preface: 'The three religions with which it deals are so intimately related to one another that in a

¹ History of Religions. By George Foot Moore, D.D., LL.D., Litt.D., Professor of the History of Religions in Harvard University. ii. Judaism, Christianity, Mohammedanism. (International Theological Library.) New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1919. pp. xvi+552.

Discovery and Revelation. A Study in Comparative Religion. By the Rev. H. F. Hamilton, D.D. (The Layman's Library.) Longmans, Green & Co., London, New York, Bombay, Calcutta, and Madras, 1915. pp. xx + 196.

The Rise of Modern Religious Ideas. By ARTHUR CUSHMAN McGIFFERT. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1915. pp. x+315.

The Manuscripts of God. A Study in Religion from the Standpoint of Evolution. By A. J. TILLYARD. Cambridge, W. Heffer & Sons, Ltd., 1919. pp. xiv + 220.

Problem der Religionspsychologie. Von Dr. Theodor Reik. i Teil. Mit einer Vorrede von Prof. Dr. Sigm. Feud. (Internationale Psychoanalytische Bibliothek, Nr. 5.) Leipzig und Wien, 1919. Internationaler Psychoanalytischer Verlag. Ges. M. B. H. pp. xxiv + 311.

The Religious Consciousness. A Psychological Study. By James Bissett Pratt, Ph.D., Professor of Philosophy in Williams College. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1920. pp. viii + 488.

² Cf. JQR., N. S., VI (July, 1915), pp. 190 f.

morphological classification they might be regarded as three branches of monotheistic religion in Western Asia and Europe.... Fundamental to all three is the idea of revealed religion.... The Scriptures of all three have the same doctrine of creation by divine fiat, ... they have the same doctrine of the catastrophic end of the world.... All three are *soteric* religions, proposing themselves as ways of salvation from the doom of all unsaved souls at death and the judgment, and each asserting that it is the only way. Each of them, conceiving itself as the one true religion, attributes to itself finality, and believes itself destined to universality...."

Turning to the body of the book, Judaism (pp. 1–106) is treated in four chapters. The first chapter, 'The Religion of Ancient Israel', gives a rapid sketch of the tribal movements and migrations and the final settlement of the Israelitish tribes in Palestine, their relations with the native peoples and their Baal cults down to the division of the kingdom. The author follows in general the much-trodden path of 'criticism', but, as it seems, somewhat hesitatingly, as if he were not fully sure of his steps in face of the fluctuating and unstable pronouncements of the critical schools. In fact, this first chapter is rather sketchy and vague.

Professor Moore is on surer ground when he reaches 'The Age of the Prophets' in chapter II. Here again is shown his skill in characterizing a phase with a few long lineaments: 'Prophecy is one of the most remarkable phenomena in the religion of Israel. Among some peoples, as in Egypt and India, the priesthood was most influential in the progress of religious thought; in Greece it was the poets and philosophers; in Israel the prophets' (p. 15). Here is how he compresses into a few words the specific messages of several of the great prophets: 'In Amos the dominant Idea of God is his inexorable righteousness; in Hosea it is his inextinguishable love; Isaiah brings out God's immeasurable might and lofty majesty'. It is rather surprising that Professor Moore repeats with many modern writers on the Prophets that the latter inveighed against cult and worship as

such: 'What God requires is not worship, but justice, uprightness and kindness' (p. 16). The Prophets of Israel were certainly not mere ethical-culturists. They were before all and above all zealous for the honour of the one true God, and exhorted the people to serve and worship Him alone. But this presupposes some cult and ceremonial. The protest of the Prophets (Isa. 1. 11 ff.; Amos 5. 21 ff., &c.) is directed against the substituting of sacrifices for righteousness and mercy, or rather against sacrifices going hand in hand with injustice and oppres-It is ignoring the genius of the Hebrew language which expresses itself in a sharp, absolute, and positive manner where we would use a comparative expression. 'I desire mercy, and not sacrifice' (Hosea 6. 6) means to say: I would prefer mercy to sacrifice, cf. Mal. 1. 2 f.; Matt. 6. 24, where Jesus says that one who serves two masters will 'either hate the one, and love the other; or else he will hold to the one, and despise the other, which is, literally taken, certainly not true, as one need not necessarily hate or despise one of the two masters he is serving; it merely means to say he will be more devoted and faithful to one than to the other.

The distinctive character of Jewish monotheism is that it 'is not the outcome of attempts to discover an ultimate principle or a supreme power in the physical universe, nor of metaphysical speculations on the nature of being, but results from a conception of history as a moral order'....' Even more distinctive is its teleological character; it finds in the history of the world not merely a judgement of the world, but the working out through judgement of the divine will for a good world which is the end of all God's ways with man' (p. 29 f.).

The common charges against Judaism met with in many modern writers are, that it set God outside of the world, and that it hardened into a cold, emotionless legalism and formalism. Our author remarks in chapter III: 'School and Synagogue', 'God is supramundane. . . . But he is not extramundane, excluded from his world because he is infinitely exalted above it. On the contrary, he is everywhere present in the world, filling it as the

soul fills the body' (p. 69 f.). The characteristic note of Jewish piety in this age is the thought of God as father—not the father of the people only, as in the Old Testament, but of individuals Expressive of love, confidence and intimacy' (p. 74). But the reviewer must resist the great temptation to quote further, e.g. what our author says in defence of the Pharisees and Scribes; his sympathetic appreciation of the stand taken by the returned exiles against the mixed marriages; as he has perhaps already overpassed the limits intended for this review. The last chapter (IV): 'Judaism Mediaeval and Modern' carries down the history to 'Zionism'. The sympathetic discussion of Hasidism and the Kabbalah is especially noteworthy.

To Christianity are given pp. 107–385. It may be only noted here that the author would seek the antecedents and premises of Paul's teaching not in the Messianic Judaism of the Apostolic Church in Jerusalem but in the composite, or fusion of, Jewish Hellenistic and Gentile Christianity, and adds: 'He was not the author, as is often assumed, but its ablest and most zealous exponent and its most original and fecund thinker'.

The treatment of Mohammedanism (pp. 386-521) is very sympathetic; in fact, it amounts to an apologia. 'The Moslem conquests were not, in fact, inspired by fanaticism, nor marked by sanguinary excesses, as wars go' (p. 409 f.). But history seems to have another story to tell. 'The moral teaching of the Koran is high; it may be fairly compared with Deuteronomy, or such compends of Jewish morals as Leviticus 19' (p. 400 f.). But whence comes the great difference between the moral and social conditions of Mohammedans and those of the Jews?

The volume closes with a select bibliography and a generous index, 'constructed for the purpose of facilitating the comparison of corresponding phenomena in different religions as well as of following the development of an idea, an institution, or a rite, in any single religion'.

Discovery and Revelation is, as the author states in the introduction, a résumé of a larger work by him in two volumes, entitled The People of God. In the present work Doctor Hamilton

traces in thirteen short chapters the development of the Jewish religion from polytheism to the ethical monotheism of the Prophets, which after the Exile became the national religion of the Jewish people, and finally was reorganized by Jesus of Nazareth into a potentially universal religion. After pointing out the raison d'être of polytheism, namely, unacquaintance with natural causation and hence the ascribing of all phenomena and happenings to supermundane agents, the author institutes a comparison between the monotheism developed by the Greeks, beginning with Thales and culminating in Socrates, Plato, and Aristotle, and that of the Hebrew Prophets. The former was based on 'discovery' from studying the facts of existence and the phenomena of nature; the latter was the result of 'revelation', of knowledge given directly by God. It was based on the experiences of a long line of prophets that Yahveh was the only true God, creator and sovereign ruler of the world, and that he is absolutely righteous. And as these experiences differed profoundly from anything we know in the ancient world, and as there was nothing in the polytheistic surroundings of the Prophets to suggest the truth of monotheism, these experiences were 'an act of sovereign divine choice'.

Dr. Hamilton stands in the main by the old orthodox landmarks, though he is well acquainted with modern liberal theological learning and accepts many of its conclusions. The book is written in a kindly, liberal spirit, and in an easy pleasant style, and will no doubt be welcomed by many Christian laymen for whom it is primarily intended.

President McGiffert's volume is based upon the Earl Lectures, given by him before the Pacific Theological Seminary, at Berkeley, California, in 1912. It is part of the series of Works on Modern Theology, published under the general editorship of James M. Whipon. It has for its object to delineate the forces and influences which led to the breaking down of the old orthodoxy which was embodied in the Protestant Confessions of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, and gave rise to modern religious thought, and is divided into two unequal parts: Book I,

chapters I-IV, pp. 1-60, Disintegration; Book II, chapters V-XIV, pp. 61-310, Reconstruction. The author obviously has Christianity in view, but many of the factors which served to undermine or modify traditional religious conceptions had, *mutatis mutandis*, also an influence on Judaism.

The movements which made for disintegration were: (r) Pietism, which arose in Germany in the seventeenth century. It was a protest of individualism against institutionalism, and emphasized personal religious experience and personal piety as of greater importance than assent to a system of theology. It has a parallel in Hasidism, which started half a century later among the Jews of Eastern Europe. (2) Enlightenment, with its appeal to reason, assigning to it a normative function in the investigation of religious truths. It has its counterpart in the Jewish Haskalah, both cradled in Germany in the eighteenth century. (3) Natural Science, which overthrew the belief in the Bible as an infallible authority in the sphere of science and the traditional cosmictheological system of the universe. (4) The critical philosophy with its attacks upon the traditional theistic proofs, denying the possibility of demonstrating the existence of God.

The reconstructive factors are: (1) Emancipation of religion, that is, making it independent from dogma and conduct, and finding its essence in man's relationship to something greater and larger than himself. (2) Rebirth of speculation, which outlines the idealistic philosophy of Fichte, Schelling, and Hegel and its relation to and influence upon the Christian system. (3) Rehabilitation of faith, rooting faith in feeling and making it a faculty of direct perception, and finding God in the realm of values, that is, the postulate of God is a value judgement (because he is needed), not an existential judgement. (4) Agnosticism. By its 'unwillingness to dogmatize about matters lying beyond the confines of personal experience' it made a positive contribution to religion, inasmuch as 'those matters which come within the range of experience have received new recognition, and particularly, the practical side of religion has attained a greater prominence'. (5 and 6) Evolution and Divine Immanence. Both are interrelated, and are inspiring 'confidence in the possibility of indefinite betterment of the conditions of life as well as of life itself'. (7) Ethical theism, which harmonizes the immanence of God with His personality and distinction from the world. (8) The character of God, substitution of the spirit of democracy for that of feudalism in the conception of God. (9) The social emphasis. Against the primary concern for the salvation of the individual soul, stress is laid on the reconstruction of a better human society. (10) Religious authority. 'It is a matter of the spirit, not of the letter, its seat is to be ultimately not in external rules or formulas or codes, but in man's experience'.

The 'reconstructive' factors enumerated and discussed by Dr. McGiffert can be summed up in the two words of romanticism and pragmatism, i.e. the confidence in one's own imaginings, feelings, and emotions, and according truth and reality to that which is workable and serves the purpose, in the present case, that which satisfies our moral demands and spiritual needs. But can our fluctuating emotions and our wayward and capricious longings and desires form a foundation of a stable and perduring religious life? Experience varies with the individual, how can it be the standard of truth? Without an objective certainty what right have we to assume that the universe is constructed so as to comfort and inspire us? Many of our postulates and longings, which we consider to be legitimate, and even praiseworthy and noble, remain unfulfilled.

Dr. McGiffert's book is an able historico-genetic exposition of the development of modern philosophical and theological thought, and as such a very valuable contribution to the literature on the history of religion; in fact, it is a compendium *in nuce* of the philosophy of religion in recent times.

Mr. Tillyard's book, with the somewhat sensational title of *The Manuscripts of God*, which is specified in the division of the book as the manuscript of man, the manuscript of nature, and the manuscript of history, is, as far as the reviewer can make out, an endeavour to derive the beliefs and tenets of religion from the constitution of man's nature and its needs, from the order of the

universe, and the facts of history. Says the author in the Introduction: 'Our object is nothing less than to discover the souls o man and God and then bring the two into relation. In our quest we propose to take experience as our guide and let it lead us where it will. In so doing we obviously make two initial assumptions: The first is that experience is trustworthy second assumption is that our own powers are trustworthy' (p. 5). He discusses then in a somewhat desultory manner, but in a frank, liberal, and tolerant spirit, man's inward self; the claims of ideals on his nature; the love of the beautiful, good, and true; the power and dominance of conscience; the function of intuition versus logic and reason; the need of faith in science and life in general; the rationality and goodness of the universe, and so on. The book is not marked by originality and depth of thought and argument, but may be helpful to those already believing or disposed to believe by clarifying their religious thinking.

Dr. Reik's book undertakes to show by some examples of representative importance what psycho-analysis can contribute to the solution of some difficult problems of religion. perhaps not be amiss to first briefly state what is meant by psycho-analysis. The theory or hypothesis of psycho-analysis, the originator of which was the Viennese doctor, Sigmund Freud, assumes that back of every human being's conscious existence is a reservoir of unconscious processes, emotions, feelings, desires and impulses mostly of a sexual nature (the libido) which from the dark recesses of the soul operate and react on the conscious ideas and actions, influencing our conscious lives in ways that we do not recognize. In fact, the unconscious is, as it were, the basis of our soul life. The conflict of the hidden, but indestructible, motives and desires, with the repressive and inhibiting conscious ideals results in indirect and veiled expressions of the libido. Psycho-analysis believes that by exploring the unconscious realm it can bring facts to light which connect and explain much that was before unconnected. Freud employed it in the treatment of various psychic and neurotic disorders, through the unearthing of some buried psychic complexes, and in the interpretation of dreams. On the other hand, from the manifestation of the unconscious processes in their later veiled phases there is a way of comprehending psychologically the formation of the psychic processes in former, primitive times.

Still another thesis of Freud's, which forms the basis of the explanations of our author, his enthusiastic follower, must be mentioned here. It is that there is a state of war between father and son, beginning in the infancy of the latter, on account of their mutual libido towards the mother. The primitive horde (urhorde) disposed of the paternal rival by the simple stratagem of killing and eating him. Hence sprang up a conflicting double affective relationship between the father and the children: On the part of the children there is on the one hand a feeling of remorse and of longing for the killed father-god coupled with the fear of revenge, on the other hand, the libido and jealousy of and consequent hostility against the father remained indestructible and incorrigible, and influence their lives. On the part of the father is the same emotional conflict: jealousy of the children, lust of revenge, fear of a repetition of the nefarious deed, coupled with the natural tenderness towards his offspring. Driven by longing and repentance the sons transferred their devotion and love to the Totem animal, adopting it as their father-god. But with regard to it too the conflicting affective attitude (the Ambivalenz, as our author terms it) comes to light: On the one hand they cherish and reverence the Totem, on the other, they every once in a while kill and consume it as they did the ur-father-god. This crime of killing and devouring the father-god, which may be termed the original sin of mankind, lies hidden like an octopus in the dark cavern of the soul, sending out its tentacles in every direction. It is the fons et origo of religion, ethics, art, in short of civilization, inasmuch as the remorse, fear of punishment, and tenderness engendered by it constituted a restraint upon man's lawless passions and wild impulses. The data and proofs for this farreaching theory of Freud our author does not give.

The four examples of religious ceremonies chosen by Dr. Reik to illustrate the *modus operandi* of the unconscious factors and

mechanisms of the emotional life and their significance for the genesis and development of religious rites, are the Couvade, the puberty rites of primitive peoples, Kol Nidre and the Shofar. The explanation which the author gives for this coupling of religious rites of primitive peoples with those from the Old Testament circle of culture, and in connexion with it his very interesting psychological characterization of the Jews, their via dolorosa through history, and their influence on the world, must be passed over. The four essays were first delivered by him as lectures, which may account for the many repetitions from one to the other, but not for the heavy, massive and involved diction, the absence of an analytical table of contents, and the neglect to give the number of the page where the author refers to parts of his book.

The Couvade is, as is well known, the custom, formerly prevalent among all or most primitive peoples and still met with in some regions, in which the father at or after the birth of a child takes to bed and receives the attentions generally shown to women at their confinement. This is called the maternity Couvade. Another phase, termed the dietetic Couvade, is that the father for some time before and after the birth of the child has to abstain from certain foods and occupations and undergo some painful operations on his body. Various explanations have been advanced by anthropologists of this rite.¹

The author rejects them as not to the point or insufficient. He explains the origin of the Couvade from a compromise (Ambivalenz) between two conflicting streams of emotions: the one, conscious of love and tenderness, comes to the surface in the efforts to mitigate the sufferings of the woman; the other, unconscious, in the latent hostility against the same woman. The social aim of the Couvade is thus a double one: to protect the woman against the latent hostile and sexual aggression by the husband; and secondarily, and fictively, to mitigate her pains. In the dietetic phase of the Couvade, in which the father imposes

¹ The interested reader may compare the article s.v. in the *Encyclop. Brit.* 11, vii, 337 f., where the literature on the subject is given.

on himself the self-denials and tortures for the sake of the protection of the health and life of the baby, is a psychic reaction of the suppressed hostile impulses against the child. Thus out of the Couvade important social institutions have been evolved: protection of the mother and care of the suckling.

In the period of puberty the *libido* tendency towards the parent is intensified, and the various torments and terrors which are, on the occasion of the initiation rites, inflicted on the novices, are intended as a punishment and prevention of the incestuous tendencies towards the mother. The author branches off to a discussion of the Greek drama, which had its origin in the rebellion of the son (Dionysus) against his father (Zeus). Jesus was a successful rebel-son inasmuch as he succeeded, if not in overthrowing the father-god, at least in being enthroned by his side.

We must pass over the engaging description of the overpowering emotional effect which the hearing of Max Bruch's famous composition on Kol Nidre had on the author, and the feelings of contrition and awe which the chanting of Kol Nidre in the Synagogue evoked in himself and in the rest of the worshippers. Whence this effect of a prosaic, juridical formula? he asks. How came it to be combined with a most solemn, awe-inspiring And above all, how is one to account for the crass contrast of this formula annulling vows, oaths, &c., with the high, overscrupulous estimation of oaths and pledges in Biblical and Rabbinical Judaism? Dr. Reik is well acquainted with various theories as to the origin of Kol Nidre and apologetic explanations of it in ancient and modern literature, but finds them all inadequate. He then discusses learnedly the relation between berit, alah, and shebuah. The berit originally referred to the murder of the father-god. When this connexion was gradually lost to later generations the oath was extended to other relations, and the fences for the protection of oaths were increased. In Kol Nidre there is a breaking through these fences. It is a declaration to break oath and renounce obligations. But this wish to violate all pledges does not refer to the petty concerns of everyday life, but back in the mind presses to the front the re- and suppressed desire to repeat the old crime. The Kol Nidre formula is, however, not a wish but the confession of a wish and prayer for forgiveness of this sinful wish. Hence the emotional convulsion and contrition it produces; they are expressions of the dread of disaster and punishment for the crime against the father-god. Kol Nidre thus is not a contrast to the high valuation of the oath in Judaism; on the contrary it confirms and proves it. But this original significance of Kol Nidre was gradually lost, and in consequence its form was mutilated and disfigured.

In his last treatise on the Shofar Dr. Reik discusses at great length and with much learning the uses of the Shofar as enumerated in the Old Testament and in the Talmud; and the explanations of its functions in the Rabbinical literature and the Kabbalah. For lack of space we must confine ourselves to a bare statement of his conclusions. The voice of the Shofar, which resembles the bellowing of a bull, is the voice of God, obviously not of Yahveh, but of the totem-god of the pre-Prophetic folkreligion of Israel. This totem-god was first a bull, later a ram. Now the totem-god was, as mentioned before, a surrogate for the slain father-god. As in the fotem-meal there is a conjunction of the consciousness of guilt and defiance, of hatred and longing (to be united with the father by incorporating him), so in the blowing of the Shofar, which is an effort at identification with the totem-god by imitating his voice, defiance and longing, hatred and love, find expression. The primary object of the Shofar ritual is to overawe and to terrify. The sounding of the Shofar, which recalls the bellowing of a bull when slain, reminds every one (unconsciously, of course) of the deicidal crime, wakens feelings of remorse and exhorts to repentance, to refrain from a repetition of the crime and to renounce the unconscious desires.

In an appendix the author discusses the 'horns' of Moses (Exod. 34. 29), in connexion with Michael Angelo's celebrated statue of Moses, the golden calf, the calves of Bethel, the stone tablets of the Decalogue, the altar of unhewn stones, fitting all of them into his main thesis. We must content ourselves with barely mentioning these items.

Dr. Reik's book exhibits great learning, acute thinking, a fertile imagination, an almost uncanny skill and agility with which he moves 'vom Hundertsten ins Tausendste', as the Germans say, and draws in and links apparently disparate subjects with his theory. But it puts a great strain on one's will to believe. Whatever reality and importance there may be in psycho-analysis, it seems here stretched to more than it can cover. 'Die Botschaft hör' ich wohl, allein mir fehlt der Glaube.'

A few corrigenda. P. 138. It is not the Talmud, which was closed in the fifth century, that quotes Jehundni (? Jehudai) Gaon who lived in the eighth century, but Alfasi on the Talmud; p. 142, for Friedrich Delitzsch read Franz D.; p. 171, Ezek. 45. 18 does not refer to the Atonement Day; p. 226, n. 1, for אבון; p. 290, n. 3, for 2 Chron. 11. 10, read 11. 15; p. 296 for , copul. put 1 copul.

Prof. Pratt's book has for its aim to describe by the inductive and empirical method the religious consciousness as it expresses itself in various forms, eschewing the defence of any fundamental thesis, or laying down or tracing out any law. Religion he defines as 'the serious and social attitude of individuals or communities toward the power or powers which they conceive as having ultimate control over their interests and destinies'. This attitude involves belief in such powers. 'Religion takes itself seriously and is not satisfied with being simply comforting and useful; it means also to be true'. Against the theory that religion is a social product (Durkheim and King) he asserts that 'very often a man's religion is the most individual thing about him'. task of the psychology of religion is to describe the workings of the human mind so far as these are influenced by its attitude toward the Determiner of Destiny. The book treats in successive chapters of Religion and the Subconscious; Society and the Individual; The Religion of Childhood; Adolescence; Two Types of Conversion; The Factors at work in Conversion; Crowd Psychology and Revivals; The Belief in God; The Belief in Immortality; The Cult and its Causes; How the Cult performs its Functions; Objective and Subjective Worship; Prayer and Private Worship, and the last five chapters are devoted to Mysticism in its various forms and phases.

The book is written in an easy and concrete style, avoiding technical terms and scholastic formulae, and illustrating theories and opinions by citing concrete experience. Thus, for instance, in studying the effects and influence of prayer the author lets those who have the habit of prayer tell their experiences; the phenomena and experiences of the mystic life he invites some of the great mystics to describe, and so for all the other functions of the religious consciousness. That the author fully and liberally gives the word to opponents need not be affirmed; in fact, a gentle and tolerant spirit is one of the outstanding characteristics of Professor Pratt's book, which will be studied with pleasure and profit.

I. M. CASANOWICZ.

United States National Museum.